

RELEASE IN PART B6

From: McHale, Judith A <McHaleJA@state.gov>
Sent: Saturday, May 7, 2011 1:47 PM
To: H; Mills, Cheryl D; Sullivan, Jacob J
Subject: Fw: PAKISTAN MEDIA ANALYSIS -- May 7, 2011
Attachments: StateSeal.gif; StateSeal.gif

Fyi

From: Douglas, Walter T
Sent: Saturday, May 07, 2011 01:27 PM
To: McHale, Judith A
Cc: Kenna, Corley; Cormack, Maureen E; DiMartino, Kitty
Subject: Fw: PAKISTAN MEDIA ANALYSIS -- May 7, 2011

Dear Judith,

Below is our media analysis from today. Not much came out of Friday prayers. The action is the debate among Pakistanis. Regards. Walter.

From: SMART Core <svcSMARTBTSRctSPrec@state.gov>
To: Rodriguez, Alberto; Jones, Anthony M; Miller, Thomas S (Athens); Davidson, Mark J; Mathews, George D; Vydmantas, Rima J; Beemer, Brent T; Douglas, Walter T
Cc: Munter, Cameron P; Johnson, Eric N; Craig, Theodore J; Foley, Rafael P; Polacheck, Joshua W; York, Bonnie K; Peccia, Jonathan R; Bergemann, John C; Brown, Thomas E; Nash, Louise A; Pratt, Jonathan G; Herbol, Denise (USAID/Pak/DIR); Ingalls, Linda C; Jea, David J; Ahlers, Ralph C; Bennett, Anne M; DeAngelis, Christian R; Richards, Marie J; Gonzalez, Francisco J; Holstege, Brian C; Sanneh, Fatuma Y; Birkinshaw, Laura M; Martin, Jamie; Bergen, Joseph G (Islamabad); Murthy, Kalpana; Hoagland, Richard E; Baker, Sherri X
Sent: Sat May 07 15:19:50 2011
Subject: PAKISTAN MEDIA ANALYSIS -- May 7, 2011

UNCLASSIFIED

Action Office: PAS
Info Office: POL_INFO

MRN: 11 ISLAMABAD 1294
Date/DTG: May 07, 2011 / 071018Z MAY 11
From: AMEMBASSY ISLAMABAD
Action: WASHDC, SECSTATE IMMEDIATE; SECDEF WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE; LONDON, AMEMBASSY ROUTINE; PARIS, AMEMBASSY ROUTINE; MOSCOW, AMEMBASSY ROUTINE; USUN NEW YORK, USMISSION IMMEDIATE; USNATO, USMISSION IMMEDIATE; WHITE HOUSE WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE; JOINT STAFF WASHINGTON DC IMMEDIATE; USPACOM HONOLULU HI ROUTINE; NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL

WASHINGTON DC *IMMEDIATE*; HQ USCENTCOM MACDILL AFB FL *ROUTINE*; DIA
 WASHINGTON DC *IMMEDIATE*

E.O.: 13526
TAGS: OIIP, OPRC, PGOV, PREL, KMDR, PK
Captions: SENSITIVE
Subject: PAKISTAN MEDIA ANALYSIS -- May 7, 2011

Note: This is an SBU product and must not be forwarded outside of the U.S. government.

PAKISTAN MEDIA ANALYSIS
May 7, 2011

- Media reflect vicious debate within GOP and military/intelligence establishment over failures
- Blame game begins; Air Chief Marshall accepts responsibility for not detecting U.S. operation
- Some Urdu TV and print commentary pushing past previous limits in criticism of the establishment
- English and Urdu social media limited in reach but also critical of the military.

The internal debate and blame game over who is responsible for the Pakistani government's failure to detect either Osama bin Laden or the U.S. operation against him is being played out through the media. We have seen unprecedented levels of criticism of the military, particularly in the Urdu television talk shows, where hosts are reflecting the nation's shock, confusion, and embarrassment over the week's events. Subsidiary to criticism of the Pakistani military, but palpable, is anger toward the U.S. for violating Pakistan's sovereignty in the operation. Curiously, though, there has been muted comment regarding yesterday's alleged drone strike; we assess this signals the continued internal disarray regarding what to say to the Pakistani people. Pakistani social media – while of very limited reach and impact -- appear to be amplifying questions raised in the international press about the Pakistani military and intelligences services' knowledge about bin Laden. Aside from bin Laden's death the killing of eight Shiite Muslims in Quetta and the imposition of 2 percent surcharge on the power tariff were significant stories today.

As the media continues to question the military's failures, Pakistani leaders are trying to explain their way out of domestic and international criticism without addressing the core issues of who knew what and when did they know it regarding bin Laden's presence in Pakistan. The leading Urdu paper, "Jang," its English language counterpart, "The News," and the largest television network, Geo TV, prominently covered Air Chief Marshal Rao Qamar's statement accepting responsibility for the air surveillance failure. They emphasized his contention that that Pakistani radars were inactive, rather than jammed, over Abbottabad during the operation. This confession, particularly by a military official, is rare in Pakistan's history, and reflective of the enormity of the humiliation that the Pakistan Army is facing. The PML-N has demanded the resignation of top officials, and rumors abound in the press that ISI Chief General Pasha may be sacked.

Statements by U.S. officials acknowledging Pakistan's contributions in the war on terror received positive coverage. State Department spokesman Mark Toner's comments brushing aside the possibility of an Indian adventure against a terrorist hideout, citing the "unique" nature of bin Laden's case, made headlines in "Nawa-i-Waqt," "The Nation," and other rightist papers. Several dailies reported Congressional support for Pakistan, particularly statements by Kerry, Lugar, and Boehner about the need to continue cooperation. However, media also accused the U.S. of playing a "double game" with Pakistan, expressing pique over Senate Armed Services Committee Chairman Carl Levin's remarks that Pakistani officials were aware of bin Laden's whereabouts and. Urdu daily "Jang," in front-page analysis, pointed out discrepancies in statements made by President Obama and Secretary Clinton extolling Pakistan's role versus Director Panetta's remarks blaming Pakistan for its connivance with terrorists.

Journalists are finding a voice and testing the limits in their criticism of the Pakistani military. Some English editorials are taking the more daring step of suggesting that the military was aware of and/or supporting bin Laden in Abbottabad, while Urdu editorials spew anger towards the U.S. over putting boots on the ground to kill bin Laden. Urdu daily "Jang" observed that "The manner, in which the American commandos conducted their operation in Abbottabad, has, justifiably, plunged the entire Pakistani nation into utter shock." The reliably anti-American Urdu daily "Nawa-i-Waqt" concluded that "there is no justification for the deployment of even a single American soldier on our soil. They should be allowed to retain their diplomatic staff here and that too, only on reciprocal basis." Another major Urdu paper, "Express," complained that "Pakistan is getting negligible assistance as compared to the massive losses we have suffered, and are still suffering, in the war against terrorism."

Continued criticism on the television talk shows of the Pakistani military, especially the ISI, and its inability to hunt bin Laden or disrupt the U.S. mission in Abbottabad is exposing a trust deficit between the Pakistan Army and the nation unparalleled in recent Pakistan's history. In another scathing tirade from a previously pro-Army host, Geo's Kamran Khan asked "After Monday's incident, why should the nation trust that the country's security system does not need an overhaul and our security agencies are alert enough to counter the enemy?" Talat Masood, a highly respected strategic analyst, asserted on the same program that the Pakistani government bears the responsibility to satisfy not only the Americans, but also its own masses.

Although many Pakistanis reacted positively to bin Laden's death on social media platforms, English and Urdu speakers expressed outrage and anger on Twitter and Facebook towards their security agencies for "failing" the Pakistani people. President Obama's speech was generally well received, but Pakistanis are demanding a better explanation about exactly what Pakistan did to assist the U.S. forces. Many social media postings are linking to international articles, in particular about American concerns over the military's possible support for bin Laden.

Urdu Editorials:

"Leadership Needs To Realize Its Responsibilities," an editorial in the leading mass circulation populist, often sensational Urdu daily "Jang" (cir. 300,000) (05/07)

"The manner, in which the American commandos conducted their operation in Abbottabad, has, justifiably, plunged the entire Pakistani nation into utter shock and is a serious concern. People think that our leadership is unable to comprehend the implications of further deterioration in Pak-U.S. relations. Perhaps, this is the reason that we did not see any considerable reaction from the government on the operation in Abbottabad operation, especially at a time when the U.S. is severely criticizing our security forces... We think that opposition parties should ask Prime Minister Gilani what strategy his government has devised to cope with the unfolding dangerous situation."

"Americans Should Answer in the Language They Understand," an editorial in the second largest, nationalist Urdu daily Nawa-i-Waqt" (cir. 150,000) (05/07)

"What is the point in asking the U.S. to curtail its military presence in Pakistan? There is no justification for the deployment of even a single American soldier on our soil. They should be allowed to retain their diplomatic staff here and that too, on reciprocal basis. In the wake of the Abbottabad operation, China is the only country that has expressed its support for Pakistan. We think the Pakistani leadership should get rid of its habit to devise ad hoc policies and say goodbye to Washington's blackmailing tactics. China is our time-tested friend upon whom we can rely in our times of dire need. In contrast, the U.S. always ditches us after its interests are served."

"Osama Operation: U.S. Mindset and Pakistan's Clear-Cut Stand," an editorial in liberal Urdu daily "Express" (cir. 25,000) (05/07)

"The U.S. operation in Islamabad has exposed loopholes in our security system which we need to address as soon as possible, so that it not be possible for any country, or terrorist organization, to challenge our sovereignty. Pakistan is getting negligible assistance compared to the massive losses we have suffered, and are still suffering, in the war against terrorism. The U.S. administration should keep in mind the ground reality not only in this region, but also in the entire world, before undertaking any adventure, or before taking any decision. Washington also needs to stop exerting unjustified pressure on Islamabad."

Editorial Cartoons

Daily Times (05/07)



The Nation (05/07)



TV Talk Shows:

For the third consecutive day, Pakistan's most-watched talk show host, Geo TV's Kamran Khan, kept up his attack on the country's military and intelligence leadership for their handling of the Abbottabad incident. Khan addressed President Zardari, Prime Minister Gilani, Army Chief General Kayani and ISI Chief General Pasha and said it is a matter of grave concern that the nation now has grave concerns about the efficacy of the defense institutions. "After Monday's incident, why should the nation trust that the country's security system does not need an overhaul and our security agencies are alert enough to counter the enemy," asked Khan. "Monday's incident has severely shaken the sense of security of the entire nation. This is a three-pronged failure of our security agencies. Our security system, just like any other national institution, is going down the hill." Khan said that the nation demands that those officials responsible for allowing the attack on the General Headquarters [GHQ], the release of Ray Davis and the Abbottabad incident should be held accountable. Khan concluded by noting that Pakistanis are being threatened by a double-edged sword: One edge of this sword is the United States which is cutting the people of Pakistan and the other edge is terrorism which is also cutting the people of Pakistan.

Another leading talk show host, Nasim Zehra, of Dunya TV, said that 'red lines' between Pakistan and the United States have been violated in the heart of Khyber Pukhtoonkhwa and Pakistan military leaders were caught unaware. "How come this could happen?" Zehra demanded. Those people responsible for protecting the sovereignty of Pakistan should resign or be fired over the Abbottabad incident. Zehra's guest, journalist Rauf Klasra, asked, Why are we so surprised? Pakistan is a country where the military repeatedly meddles in the politics of the country, and runs its nuclear and foreign policy with India, Afghanistan and the United States, so it makes it really meaningless to ask why this incident happened. The problem today confronting Pakistan is that the role of army in the national level has increased to such a great extent that the civilian government is just a cover for the army.

In an Aaj News program, host Nadia Naqi noted that in the wake of the Abbottabad operation, the U.S. has called on Pakistan to answer questions about the presence of OBL a military city under the very nose of the country's intelligence and security agencies. One guest, a senior defense analyst, said that the Pakistani government needs to provide answers, not just to the Americans but also to Pakistanis. He added that it is matter of serious concern that our intelligence agencies failed to track down such a high-value target who was residing in a sensitive area of the country. The U.S. operation has exposed the weakness of our intelligence services, the former general added. Another guest, a A PML-Q leader, said that Pakistan should refuse to surrender to the American's pressure to provide information. He went on to defend the ISI, saying that even the CIA has also failed on several occasions. For instance, it failed to inform the U.S. government before the 9/11

attack. Another guest said that the civilian government and military of Pakistan are not on the same page. The contradictions in the statements given by the Foreign Office and the military clearly demonstrate these differences.

Information Office
Public Affairs Section
U.S. Embassy Islamabad
Pakistan

Stay connected with <http://islamabad.usembassy.gov/>



Courtney Beale
Deputy Information Officer
Public Affairs Section
U.S. Embassy Islamabad Pakistan
Mobile:

Stay connected with <http://islamabad.usembassy.gov/>



B6

Signature: Munter

Drafted By: ISLAMABAD:Beale, Courtney A.
Cleared By: Islamabad:Beale, Courtney A Kramer
Approved By: Islamabad:Davidson, Mark J
Released By: ISLAMABAD:Beale, Courtney A.
Info:
Attachments: Metadata.dat

Action Post:
Dissemination Rule: POL_INFO, PAS

UNCLASSIFIED