

RELEASE IN PART
B6

From: Sullivan, Jacob J <SullivanJJ@state.gov>
Sent: Monday, January 24, 2011 2:27 PM
To: H
Subject: Fw: Rice/Al Jazeera -- telcon with P
Attachments: AJ docs.doc; Rice-Qurei-Livni Mtg 6-15-08 Doc 12.pdf; AJ docs.doc; Rice-Qurei-Livni Mtg 6-15-08 Doc 12.pdf

Fyi

From: Wells, Alice G
To: Feltman, Jeffrey D; Walles, Jacob; Hale, David M; Sullivan, Jacob J; Abedin, Huma
Cc: Sutphin, Paul R; P-NEA Duty
Sent: Mon Jan 24 13:20:57 2011
Subject: Rice/Al Jazeera -- telcon with P

Former Secretary Rice called Bill to inquire where matters stood with the release of alleged Palestinian negotiation documents by Al-Jazeera, noting that she was saying nothing publicly. Bill described our public posture (as per below). Rice said she would adhere to that approach. If matters deteriorated and she could say something useful, Rice asked that we let S know that she was prepared to help, but that she would take her cue from S. Bill thanked her for the offer and said that we would stay in touch. David/Jake, Bill asks that we keep Rice's staff updated as appropriate. Thx,

From: Sutphin, Paul R
Sent: Monday, January 24, 2011 12:47 PM
To: Wells, Alice G
Cc: Walles, Jacob; Buzbee, John R; Jacoby, Julia I
Subject: FW: al Jazeera "Palestine Papers" document leak -- initial analysis of documents posted

Alice, per Jake, here's our first cut at an analysis of the Pal documents (attached as a word doc, and at the very bottom of this message for BB readers).

Also attached is a PDF of the leaked document (meeting notes) involving former Sec Rice.

Today's press guidance in near-final follows below:

NEA Press Guidance January 24, 2011

Palestinians: Release of Alleged Palestinian Negotiations Documents by Al-Jazeera

Q: What is the U.S. reaction to Al-Jazeera's release of alleged negotiations documents related to Middle East peace efforts?

- **These are not U.S. documents. We cannot vouch for their veracity.**

- **We do not plan to comment on any particular document.**
- **None of this changes our understanding of what is at stake and what needs to be done. A framework agreement that resolves the core issues remains possible and necessary.**

Q. Is this the nail in the coffin of peace talks between Israel and the Palestinians?

- **We remain committed to a two-state solution; we will continue to work with the parties to narrow existing gaps and work towards a framework agreement.**
- **We have an important meeting of the Quartet next week and will redouble of efforts in the coming days.**
- **We have been in touch with a variety of leaders in the region over the past 24 hours. Most of these calls were made by Special Envoy Mitchell and his Deputy David Hale to prepare for the Quartet meeting, but we have discussed the current situation.**

Q. Does this make movement toward a resolution in New York more likely?

- **Our position has not changed. We do not believe New York is the right forum to resolve these issues.**

Drafted by: NEA/PPD: E Pelton, x74148

Approved by:

NEA/FO: J Walles

SEMEP: D Hale

Cleared by: NEA/IPA: P Sutphin

NEA/PPD: E Vasquez

P: C de Juana

ok

D(S): D Schrepel

S/P: D Rand

ok

SEMEP: A Sachar

ok

Paul Sutphin

Director

Office of Israel and Palestinian Affairs
Room 6251, Department of State

(T) 202-647-3672 (F) 202-736-4461

SBU
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

From: Sutphin, Paul R
Sent: Sunday, January 23, 2011 10:52 PM
To: NEA-FO-DL; NEA-IPA-DL; NEA-SEMEP-DL; Sullivan, Jacob J; Mull, Stephen D; Crowley, Philip J; Cunningham, James B; Goldberger, Thomas H; Rubinstein, Daniel H; Marchese, Gregory M; Waters, John R; Silverman, Robert J; SWO; Scobey, Margaret; Tueller, Matthew H; Beecroft, Robert S (Amman); 'pkumar [redacted] 'dshapiro [redacted] Kennedy, Patrick F; Pelton, Erin; Djerassi, Alexander M; Vasquez, Edgar J; Sayles, Ambrose G; Mandel, Lawrence C (Amman)
Subject: al Jazeera "Palestine Papers" document leak -- initial analysis of documents posted

B6

All:

As discussed earlier today, we've looked at the 16 purported Palestinian peace process documents posted by Al Jazeera on its website; attached is an initial brief analysis/overview. Text is also pasted below for BB reading .

Paul Sutphin
Director
NEA/IPA

SENSITIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED

Al-Jazeera's purported PA documents

Al Jazeera announced it has almost 1,700 "confidential" documents related to Israeli-Palestinian peace efforts in its possession. It calls the documents the "Palestine Papers" and is airing 4 special broadcasts on the leaks. As far as we can determine, the documents appear to be authentic, but we cannot confirm that independently. So far, only sixteen of the purported documents, all in English, have been posted to Al Jazeera's website - with more certainly to come. Most are minutes and maps from Annapolis-era negotiating sessions (including the June 2008 trilateral meeting in which former Secretary Rice participated). None appear to be USG documents. So far the only document from the tenure of the current administration is a January 2010 session between D/SEMEP David Hale and Erekat.

We believe that the leak of these documents will seriously damage the standing of the Palestinian leadership and complicate their ability to re-join a negotiating process. The documents that have been released so far reveal little of US negotiating strategy, but the impact of their release on the Palestinians will harm US peace efforts.

The likely source of these documents is a former staffer from Saeb Erekat's PLO

Negotiation Affairs Department (NAD). The NAD's subordinate Negotiation Support Unit (NSU), a donor-financed office staffed mainly by international personnel, has undergone significant staffing changes over the past year, and several personnel left disillusioned by Erekat and his management of the office. According to NSU staff this evening (in strict confidence), they were already aware of a major breach of information security.

Al Jazeera's website coverage - which so far focuses on purported concessions by the Palestinian side on the highly sensitive refugee and Jerusalem issues - and the combative interview of Erekat on Al Jazeera this evening, have led many of our Palestinian contacts to speculate that Erekat stands to lose the most from these disclosures. That said, we can anticipate that President Abbas will stand with Erekat, even as he suffers criticism as well.

Israeli liabilities appear fewer in the current tranche of documents. Most of the details of former PM Olmert's offer have already appeared in the public domain (including in a speech Olmert gave in late 2010). However, then-FM and current opposition leader Livni may suffer fallout from the disclosure of her role in the Annapolis negotiations, in particular her discussion of Jerusalem issues with the Palestinian negotiating team.

1. Meeting Minutes: 1st Meeting on Territory

March 12, 2008, King David Hotel, West Jerusalem

- Palestinian: Dr. Samih Al-Abed, Khaled Elgindy, Nizar Farsakh
- Israeli: Udi Dekel and Dani Tirza

Palestinian and Israeli parties discussed parameters for discussions including language and understandings on territories and borders. Israeli side refused to engage on the basis of the 1967 line or to accept the principle of a swap.

2. Map: Israeli Proposal for Etzion Bloc

March 30, 2008

Likely Palestinian-produced map displaying purported Israeli offer for Gush Etzion settlement bloc. Some details on bypass roads and other modalities to facilitate Palestinian movement around/under Israeli controlled areas. No other identifying features or details on discussion.

3. Land Swap Proposal Map - 10.6% of West Bank

April 7, 2008

Likely Palestinian-produced map of purported Israeli proposal showing a land swap and settler evacuation representing 10.6% of West Bank. No other identifying features or details on discussion. Shows details on major settlements to be annexed and identifies areas of West Bank planned for evacuation, including all of the Hebron area settlements and all of the smaller settlements in the northern West Bank.

4. Meeting Summary: 5th Meeting on Territory

April 7, 2008, King David Hotel, West Jerusalem

- Palestinian: Dr. Samih Al-Abed, Azem Bishara, Khaled Elgindy, Nizar Farsakh and Fouad Hallak
- Israeli: Udi Dekel, Dani Tirza, Leah Arad and Kamil Abu-Rukun

Sides presented conflicting views on land swaps; Palestinian note-taker reported poor atmospherics and said Palestinians responded that Israeli presentation indicated a lack of good faith.

5. Land Swap Proposal Map - 1.5%

April 8, 2008

Likely a Palestinian proposal, although not identified as such (as are documents numbers 6 and 7).

6. Land Swap Proposal Map - 1.5% of West Bank

April 8, 2008

7. Land Swap Proposal Map - 2% of West Bank

April 8, 2008

8. Maps: Israeli Proposals at Taba and Camp David II

April 10, 2008

Apparently Palestinian-produced comparative maps showing what purports to be Israeli positions on territory for both negotiations, with the Taba map representing a much scaled-back proposal for annexations.

9. Meeting Minutes: Borders with Erekat, Qurei and Livni

May 4, 2008, King David Hotel, West Jerusalem

- Palestinians side: Ahmad Qurei (Abu Ala'), Dr. Saeb Erekat, Dr. Samih al-Abed, Khaled Elgindi, Salah Ilayan, Zeinah Salahi
- Israeli side: Tzipi Livni, Udi Dekel, Tal Becker, Dani Terza

Abu Ala' seems to signal Palestinian willingness to compromise on refugees and Jerusalem. He discusses conditions for land swaps, including land swaps within parts of Jerusalem ("land in Jerusalem for land in Jerusalem"). He also notes that not all refugees will return to Israel: "The Palestinian state must have adequate land, capabilities and resources to absorb Palestinian refugees who do not prefer to return to Israel, and those who hope to return to Palestine."

10. Meeting Minutes: Post-Annapolis Plenary Session on Territory

May 21, 2008 Inbal Hotel Jerusalem,

- Palestinian: Ahmed Querei (Abu Ala'), Dr. Saeb Erekat (SE), Dr. Samih il Abd (SIA), Khaled Elgindy (KE), Salah Elayan (SA), Zeinah Salahi (ZS)
- Israeli: FM Tzipi Livni (TL), Tal Becker (TB), Udi Dekel (UD), Dany Tirza (DT)

Following a discussion of news reports regarding Israel's decision to negotiate with Syria over the return of the Golan, the meeting focused primarily on the Israeli side presenting their assessment of the Palestinian land-swap proposals. Livni touches on sensitive issues of Jerusalem and withdrawal from Golan.

TL:Jerusalem is not included [on our map] because it's not being discussed here, but clearly we know it has to be discussed.

[News comes in of 286 new units to be tendered in Betar 'Illit.]

TL: We're giving up the Golan so we need more in Betar 'Illit.

11. Meeting Minutes: 8th Meeting on Territory

May 29, 2008 Jerusalem, King David Hotel

- Palestinian: Dr. Samih Al-Abed, Azem Bishara, Hala Rashed, Fouad Hallak, Nizar Farsakh
- Israeli: Udi Dekel, Dani Tirza, Lea Arad, and Kamil Abu Rukun

12. Meeting Minutes: Trilateral - United States, Israel and Palestine

June 15, 2008 Jerusalem, Inbal Hotel

- American side: - Condoleeza Rice, David Welch, Eliot Abrams, Jamal Hilal
- Palestinian side: - Ahmad Qurei (Abu Ala), Dr Saeb Erekat, Salah Ilayan
- Israeli side: Tzipi Livni, Tal Becker, Udi Dekel

Abu Ala on Jerusalem: We proposed that Israel annexes all settlements in Jerusalem except Jabal Abu Ghneim (Har Homa). This is the first time in history that we make such a proposition; we refused to do so in Camp David.

Secretary Rice discounts the idea of an international peacekeeping force in a Palestinian state. Referring to Iraqi PM Maliki and Canada as "incapable" in the context of border control/security issues, she reportedly says: "I have full trust in Nouri Malki, Iraq's Prime Minister, but he is incapable. Canada has sincere desire but there came a time when Canada was incapable of controlling the borders."

13. Meeting Minutes: General Plenary Meeting - June 30, 2008

June 30, 2008 West Jerusalem

- Palestinian: Ahmed Qurei (Abu Ala'), Dr. Saeb Erekat (SE), Salah Aleyan, Rami Dajani
- Israeli: Tzipi Livni, Udi Dekel, Tal Becker

Palestinian side tries to inject issue of Jerusalem into discussions; Israelis silent. At one point SE notes: It is no secret that on our map we proposed we are offering you the biggest Yerushalayim in history. But we must talk about the concept of Al-Quds.

14. Summary of Ehud Olmert's "Package" Offer to Mahmoud**Abbas - August 31, 2008**

August 31, 2008

This document purportedly summarizes PM Olmert's offer to Mahmud Abbas on territory, Jerusalem, refugees and security. Under the described agreement, Israel would annex 6.8% of the West Bank, and safe passage between Gaza and West Bank would be under Israeli sovereignty. Sovereignty over the Holy Basin would be delayed to a later stage. On refugees, Israel would acknowledge the suffering of – but not responsibility for – Palestinian refugees. No mention is made of security. Most of the details of former PM Olmert's offer have already appeared in the public domain (including in a speech Olmert gave in late 2010).

15. NSU Charts of Israeli Settlement Growth

November 4, 2009

Palestinian projections of the pace of settlement growth.

16. Meeting Minutes: Saeb Erekat and David Hale

January 15, 2010 Jericho, NAD

- Palestinians: Dr Saeb Erekat (SE), Rami Dajani
- US: David Hale (DH), Daniel Rubenstein, Rick Waters

Some details of USG planning are exposed. Erekat expresses interest in opening a secret channel to the GOI:

DH: Raise this with Molcho.

SE: I will. I've tried to meet him before.

DH: He's ready now.

SE: I want to construct a channel so it doesn't go down in one day. We can't say we're resuming negotiations. We keep the channel secret. Use it to discuss our strategic relations. The priority is not to have collapse on the ground.